

PLANNING COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON TUESDAY, 30 JUNE 2020

Present:

Councillor Diana Ruff (Chair) (in the Chair)
Councillor Jayne Barry (Vice-Chair)

Councillor William Armitage
Councillor Andrew Cooper
Councillor Peter Elliott
Councillor Mark Foster
Councillor David Hancock
Councillor Carol Huckerby

Councillor Maureen Potts
Councillor Alan Powell
Councillor Tracy Reader
Councillor Jacqueline Ridgway
Councillor Kathy Rouse

Also Present:

R Purcell	Joint Head Of Service - Planning
A Kirkham	Planning Manager - Development Management
C Wilson	Planning Officer
J Fieldsend	Legal Team Manager (non contentious)
N Calver	Governance Manager
A Maher	Senior Governance Officer
D Stanton	Governance Officer
A Bryan	Governance Officer
M E Derbyshire	Members ICT & Training Officer

PLA/1/20-21 Apologies for Absence and Substitutions

No apologies for absence were submitted.

PLA/2/20-21 Declarations of Interest

Members were requested to declare the existence and nature of any disclosable pecuniary interest and/or other interests, not already on their register of interests, in any item on the agenda and withdraw from the meeting at the appropriate time.

No Declarations of Interest were submitted.

PLA/3/20-21 Minutes of Last Meeting

RESOLVED – That the Minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on 10 March 2020 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

PLA/4/20-21 NED/19-00786 - Cartledge Hall Farm - Dronfield

The Committee considered Report No PM/01/20-21 of the Planning Manager – Development Management.

The report to Committee explained that an application had been submitted to

demolish a range of existing buildings (formerly used in association with the livery business and riding school) at Cartledge Hall Farm, Cartledge Lane, Holmesfield, Dronfield for Mr Matthew Jacques c/o Crowley Associates Ltd. Existing buildings (formerly used in association with the livery business and riding school) would be converted to form a single dwelling and ancillary buildings would be restored and retained. The application also proposed the erection of four new dwellings with associated landscaping, parking and access (conservation area/affecting a public right of way).

The application had been referred to the Committee by Councillor C Huckerby, who had raised concerns about it.

The ward Member, Councillor C Huckerby, spoke against the application. She subsequently did not take part in the Committee's discussion on this matter nor vote on the application.

Six objectors spoke against the application.

The Applicant spoke in favour of the application.

The Architect and Heritage Consultant for the proposed scheme spoke in favour of the application.

No supporters spoke in favour of the application.

Committee was directed to the recent late comments/update reports which had been issued the afternoon prior to the meeting.

Members were reminded that the application had been considered at the Committee's meeting, on 10 March 2020. Committee had resolved to defer consideration of the application, so that the applicant could reflect on the application and determine whether he wished to amend it as a result of the comments made by Members at the meeting.

Planning Committee considered the application. It was confirmed that this had not been amended from that submitted to the Committee in March 2020. Committee took into account the suitability of the proposal in the location in policy terms, its effect on the character of the site and the surrounding area and its impact on the Green Belt. The Committee also considered the impact on heritage assets, the privacy and amenity of neighbours, and highway safety issues.

Members discussed the application. They heard about the contribution which the scheme could make to restoring historic buildings, dating from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. They also heard about the comparatively modern buildings that would be removed and the new buildings that would be constructed on the site, which lay within a conservation area.

Members sought clarification on the details of the scheme and the opportunities for local people to express their views on the proposed development. They discussed the advantages and disadvantages of the scheme and in particular, whether the benefits of the development in terms of renovating the older buildings, would offset possible damage the environment and whether it would be

an appropriate development for the greenbelt and a conservation area.

RESOLVED -

- (a) That application NED/19-00786 be refused, contrary to Officer Recommendations.
- (b) That the reasons for refusal, focused on inappropriate development in the Greenbelt and the impact on the local conservation area, be finalised by officers in consultation with the Chair and Vice Chair of the Committee.

PLA/5/20-21 NED/20-00185 - Scout Hut, Holmesfield

The Committee considered Report No PM/02/20-21/AK of the Planning Manager – Development Management.

The report to Committee explained that an application had been submitted for the construction of Scout Hut and use of land for outdoor recreation (revised scheme of 18/01159/FL) (Conservation area/Affecting setting) at land north of St Swithin's Church, Vicarage Close, Holmesfield for the 3rd Holmesfield Scout Group, care of the Agent.

The local Ward Member, Cllr C Huckerby, had formally requested that the application be considered by Planning Committee, rather than be determined under Delegated Powers by officers.

One objectors spoke against the application.

The Applicant spoke in support of the application.

One representative from the Parish Council spoke in support of the application.

The local ward Member, Councillor C Huckerby made a statement explaining her support for the application. She subsequently took no part in the Commission's consideration of the application nor its determination on it.

Members were directed to the recent late comments/update report which had been issued the afternoon prior to the meeting.

Planning Committee considered the application. In this context it took into account the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and in particular, whether the development would be compatible with Paragraph 145 of the NPPF, which states that local planning authorities should normally regard the construction of new buildings in Green Belt as inappropriate.

Members discussed the application. They discussed how the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) defined exceptions to inappropriate development in the Green Belt, which includes the provisions of appropriate facilities for outdoor sport and outdoor recreation, as long as the facilities preserve the openness of the Green Belt. They discussed whether it would be appropriate to allow this development in the Green Belt, the implications for the surrounding conservation area and the potential impact of the proposed development on local residents

RESOLVED – That application number NED/20/00185/FL be refused in line with officer recommendations.

PLA/6/20-21 Planning Appeals Lodged and Determined

The following appeals have been lodged:-

Mrs A Hayward - Conversion of Traditional Buildings to B1(a) Office Use, A3 Cafe; Conversion of Farm Building to B1(c) Joiners Workshop; Demolition of Existing Agricultural Buildings and the Provision of Car Parking (Conservation Area/Listed Building/Resubmission of 17/01251/FL) (Amended Plans/ Amended Title) at Renishaw Hall, Renishaw Park, Renishaw (18/01116/FL)

Mrs A Hayward - Application for listed building consent for Conversion of Traditional Buildings to B1(a) Office Use, A3 Cafe; Conversion of Farm Building to B1(c) Joiners Workshop; Demolition of Existing Agricultural Buildings and the Provision of Car Parking (Conservation Area/Listed Building/Resubmission of 17/01251/FL) (Amended Plans/ Amended Title) Renishaw Hall, Renishaw Park, Renishaw (18/01117/LB)

Mr T Brooks - Application for prior approval for the change of use of an existing agricultural barn to two dwellings (Resubmission of 16/01049/CUPDMB) at Bacons Springs Farm, Mill Lane, Clay Cross (19/01117/CUPDMB)

Mr Cliff Richards - Outline application for the erection of up to 250 dwellings (Major Development/Contrary to development plan/Affecting a Public Footpath)(Amended Plans)(Amended Title) at Land East Of Williamthorpe Road And South Of Tibshelf Road, Holmewood (18/01170/OL)

Mr W Clay - Approval of Reserved Matters (access, layout, scale, appearance and landscaping) for 3 dwellings pursuant to outline planning permission 15/01225/OL (Affecting a public right of way) at The Bungalow, Park Farm, Park Avenue, Holmesfield (19/00451/RM)

Mr T Henighan - Construction of ground and first floor extension to side and rear to provide new dwelling at 44 Church Lane, Calow (19/00878/FL)

Mr and Mrs D Walker - Outline application with all matters reserved except of access for the erection of two dwellings at Land To The North Of School Farm Church Land And South Of Cornlands, Carr Lane, Brackenfield (19/01063/OL)

Mr and Mrs Corker - Application for American barn style stables and manege (revised scheme of 19/00325/FL) at Cowley Hall Farm, Cowley Lane, Holmesfield (19/01197/FL)

C/O Neil Twigg - Application to vary condition 5 (Construction traffic Management plan) and 7 (timetable to green lane access) pursuant of 14/00901/FL at Land To The Rear Of 14 To 22 Green Lane And 4 To 16 Park Avenue, Dronfield (19/01147/FL)

Ms A Strong - Construction of a two-storey extension at Bluebell Woods Cottage,

Barlow Lees Lane, Barlow (20/00009/FLH)
Mr Bowler - Conversion of garage with first floor extension over at Bonne Vienne, Staveley Road, Duckmanton (20/00073/FLH)

Mr W Treece - SAS Homes - Proposed residential development of 3no Eco Homes (resubmission of 18/00609/FL)(Conservation Area/Affecting the setting of a Listed Building) at Sutton Manor, Palterton Lane, Sutton Scarsdale (19/00626/FL)

Ms R Johnson - Application for Listed Building consent for the installation of two cream composite doors (Listed building) at Crofters Barn, Westthorpe Road, Killamarsh (19/00748/LB)

The following appeals have been allowed :-

Mr A Cox - Green 4 Developments Ltd – Outline application (all matters other than access reserved for further approval) for the erection of 24 dwellings, new access and provision of open space (Revised scheme of NED/17/01243/OL)(Major Development)(Departure from Development Plan)(Affecting the setting of a Listed Building/Conservation Area) (Amended Plan) (Amended Title) at Land North Of 92 Chesterfield Road, Shirland (19/00056/OL)

Mr and Mrs A Cain- Green 4 Developments Ltd – Retention of single/two-storey front extension, two-storey side extension and single-storey rear extension with rendering to the external facades of the property (Amended Plans) (Conservation Area) (Revised scheme of 18/00567/FLH) at 6 Wellfield Close, Ridgeway (19/00680/FLH)

C/O Neil Twigg - Application to vary conditions 5 (Method statement) and 7 (Implementation Plan and Timetable) pursuant of 14/00901/FL (Amended title/Amended plans) at Land To The Rear Of 14 To 22 Green Lane And 4 To 16 Park Avenue, Dronfield (19/00809/FL)

The following appeals have been dismissed:-

Mr And Mrs Linell - Application to convert triple garage together with single storey side extension to form dwelling at Highbrook , Far Lane , Barlow (19/00540/FL)

Mr and Mrs Temperton - Proposed two storey detached dwelling with detached garage/ancillary accommodation (revised scheme of previously withdrawn 18/01277/FL) (Amended Title/Amended Plans) at Carbery Wood, Kelstedge Lane, Brockhurst, Ashover (19/00453/FL)

Mr A Rowland - Erection of single detached dwelling on infill plot. (Conservation area) at Land North Of Main Road, Troway, Marsh Lane (19/00525/OL)

No appeals have been withdrawn.

PLA/7/20-21 Matters of Urgency

There were no matters of urgency.